

Tyre Tender evaluation and recommendation 2015

<u>Supplier</u>	<u>Annual Tender value</u>	<u>3 year contract value</u>	<u>Weighted %</u>
Watling Tyre Service Ltd	£47,812.00	£143,436.00	96.67%
Direct Tyre Management	£52,274.00	£156,822.00	92.67%
Tructyre Fleet Management LTD	£47,637.00	£142,911.00	98.00%

Conclusion

All aspects of the tender submissions were looked at carefully. Because the results were very close across all three submissions additional pricing information was requested based on our high usage tyre sizes and preferred brands to give all an equal opportunity to be compared like for like on pricing. Tructyre Fleet Management Limited were most competitive on cost for this part of the evaluation.

Tructyre Fleet Management Limited have proven themselves to be a very capable service provider and as such they have scored slightly higher in the area of capability of the tenderer to support all elements of the contract. The recommendation is for the contract to be awarded to Tructyre Fleet Management Limited as this supplier offers the best value and a proven record to meet all aspects of the contract.

Watling Tyre Service Ltd						
WEIGHTING MATRIX						
Evaluation Criteria		Weighting	Mark out of 10	Weighted score	Convert to %	Mark x Weighting
a)	Value for Money	60%				
(i)	Price	20	9	180		
(ii)	Compliance with specification	20	10	200		
(iii)	Technical merit and quality factors	20	10	200		
		60	29	580	97%	58.0%
				/600		
b)	Completeness of Response	40%				
(i)	Assessed capability of tenderer to support all elements of the contract	20	9	180		
(ii)	Acceptance of existing contract conditions.	10	10	100		
(iii)	Questionnaire response	30	10	300		
		60	29	580	97%	38.7%
				/200		
					Total	96.7%

Direct Tyre Management						
WEIGHTING MATRIX						
Evaluation Criteria		Weighting	Mark out of 10	Weighted score	Convert to %	Mark x Weighting
a)	Value for Money	60%				
(i)	Price	20	8	160		
(ii)	Compliance with specification	20	10	200		
(iii)	Technical merit and quality factors	20	10	200		
		60	28	560	93%	56.0%
				/600		
b)	Completeness of Response	40%				
(i)	Assessed capability of tenderer to support all elements of the contract	20	9	180		
(ii)	Acceptance of existing contract conditions.	10	10	100		
(iii)	Questionnaire response	30	9	270		
		60	28	550	92%	36.7%
				/200		
					Total	92.7%

Tructyre Fleet Management LTD						
WEIGHTING MATRIX						
Evaluation Criteria		Weighting	Mark out of 10	Weighted score	Convert to %	Mark x Weighting
a)	Value for Money	60%				
(i)	Price	20	10	200		
(ii)	Compliance with specification	20	10	200		
(iii)	Technical merit and quality factors	20	10	200		
		60	30	600	100%	60.0%
				/600		
b)	Completeness of Response	40%				
(i)	Assessed capability of tenderer to support all elements of the contract	20	10	200		
(ii)	Acceptance of existing contract conditions.	10	10	100		
(iii)	Questionnaire response	30	9	270		
		60	29	570	95%	38.0%
				/200		
					Total	98.0%

Tyre Tender evaluation scores weighting 2015

Tender Pricing Mixed Brands		
Watling Tyre Service Ltd	Price	Brand
Miscellaneous + Brand	£ 47,812.00	Hankook
Miscellaneous + Alternate Brand	£ 38,108.00	Budget
Miscellaneous + Recover	£ 42,107.00	Vaculu
Direct Tyre Management Ltd	Price	Brand
Miscellaneous + Brand	£ 52,274.00	Hankook
Miscellaneous + Alternate Brand	£ 42,946.00	Kerb Ring
Miscellaneous + Recover	£ 37,149.00	Budget
Tructyre Limited	Price	Brand
Miscellaneous + Brand	£ 47,637.34	Kormoran
Miscellaneous + Alternate Brand	£ 44,858.62	Wastemaster
Miscellaneous + Recover	£ 44,217.10	Unknown

Same Brand Price Comparison

Company	Tyre	Unit Cost	Annual Volume	Total Per Year
DTM	11R225 Bandvulc Wastemaster	£238.00	39	£ 9,282.00
	11R225 Kormoran Urban	£250.00	39	£ 9,750.00
	315/80R225 Bandvulc Wastemaster	£285.00	61	£ 17,385.00
	315/80R225 Kormoran	£255.00	61	£ 15,555.00
	Average Price			£ 12,993.00
Truck Tyre	11 x 22.5 Bandvulc Waste Master	£191.26	39	£ 7,459.14
	11X 22.5 Kormoran Urban	£234.96	39	£ 9,163.44
	315/80R225 Bandvulc Wastemaster	£257.50	61	£ 15,707.50
	315/80R225 Kormoran	£249.31	61	£ 15,207.91
	Average Price			£ 11,884.50
Watling Tyres	11 x 22.5 Bandvulc Waste Master	£220.00	39	£ 8,580.00
	11X 22.5 Kormoran Urban	£220.00	39	£ 8,580.00
	315/80R225 Bandvulc Wastemaster	£265.00	61	£ 16,165.00
	315/80R225 Kormoran	£245.00	61	£ 14,945.00
	Average Price			£ 12,067.50

Tyre Pre-Qualification Questionnaire 2012

1	Name & Address of Firm	1	Direct Tyre Management Oasis Business Park, Parkside Place, Prescott Rd Skelmersdale Lancashire WN89RD	1	Tructyre Fleet Management LTD Goodwood House Eastleigh Hampshire SO504NT
0	Registered Address of Office	0	Unit 8, Orbital One, Green Street, Green Road, Dartford, Kent, DA1 1QG	0	Goodwood House, Eastleigh, Hampshire, SO504NT
1	Name of person making application	1	Roger Flury	1	Steven Anthony Shingleton
1	Address for correspondence, telephone, email & fax no	1	1-3 Peiham Road, Gravesend Kent DA110HN Tel 01474320740 Private Limited Company 4 officers	1	Goodwood House, Eastleigh, Hampshire, SO504NT
0	Sole trader, partner, company or other	0	Private Limited Company	0	0300100707
1	List full names of every officer	1	4 officers	1	Limited Company
1	Have any officers been bankrupt or involved in liquidation etc.	1	No	1	Glen Sherwood
1	Has any officer been employed by SDC	1	No	1	N/A
1	Has any officer had a relative(s) who is employed at senior level by SDC	1	No	1	N/A
1	Persons who have involvement in other Firms who provide a service to SDC	1	None	1	N/A
0	Questions for partnerships & sole traders	0		0	
0	Full names of all equity partners	0	N/A	0	n/a
0	What is the total number of partners	0	N/A	0	n/a
0	When was the Firm formed	0	N/A	0	n/a
0	Is the Firm a member of a group including other Firms	0	N/A	0	n/a
0	If yes give full details	0	N/A	0	n/a
0	Questions only for companies	0		0	
2	Registration no. and date of registration under companies Act 1985	2	842789 26/03/1965	2	03959449 23-05-2000
1	If your Firm is a member of a group, please describe relationship with group	1	No	1	Parent
1	If Firm is a member of group state name & address of ultimate company	1	No	1	TFM Holdings Ltd
0	Would the group or ultimate holding company be guarantee to your Firm	0		0	Yes
0	SECTION B FINANCIAL STANDING	0		0	
1	Name of person responsible for financial matters in your Firm	1	Mathew Abbott ACA Financial Director	1	Mr Matt Norcliffe
1	Enclosed copies of all audited accounts & annual reports for last 3 years	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	If you can not submit the above, is trading position now similar	1	Yes	1	Yes
0	If no please give details	0		0	n/a
0	If yes to 3 include turnover since last published accounts	0		0	n/a
1	Provide name and address of bankers & confirm we may obtain references	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Firms current turnover for the type of work you are interested in	1	see accounts	1	£26,693,429
1	Details of any outstanding claims or litigation against the firm	1		1	None
0	Taxation	0		0	
1	VAT registration number	1	206284490	1	844600832
1	Please state if any persons in your Firm have ever been convicted of fraud	1	No	1	No
0	If yes please give details	0		0	
0	Insurance	0		0	
1	Insurance Details, Employers Liability Insurance Held	1	Liverpool Victoria	1	Allianz
1	Policy number	1	MTC1000699996	1	SM16371987/05
1	Extent of Cover	1	£10,000,000.00	1	£10,000,000.00
1	Expiry Date	1	30/09/2015	1	14/05/2015
1	Copy of policy held enclosed	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Public Liability (Third Party) Insurance Held	1	Liverpool Victoria	1	Allianz
1	Policy number	1	MTC1000699996	1	SM16371987/05
1	Extent of Cover	1	£5,000,000.00	1	£5,000,000.00
1	Expiry Date	1	30/09/2015	1	14/05/2015
1	Copy of policy held enclosed	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Professional Indemnity Insurance Held	1	Liverpool Victoria	0	No
1	Policy number	1	MTC1000699996	0	
1	Extent of Cover	1	£5,000,000.00	0	
1	Expiry Date	1	30/09/2015	0	
1	Copy of policy held enclosed	1	Yes	0	
1	Details of any claims in excess of £15,000 made under your Firm	1	None	1	None
0	Bank Details	0		0	
1	Barclays Corporate, London E149GE	1		1	National Westminster Bank PLC
0	SECTION C TECHNICAL CAPACITY AND ABILITY	0		0	
1	Name and reference of contract which you are applying	1	For the Supply of Vehicle Tyres and Associated Services	1	OS-DNWA-9VNHGB
1	Any deduction for liquidated in the last 3 years	1	No	1	No
1	Any contract terminated or employment terminated under contract terms	1	No	1	No
1	Has Firm ever not had a contract renewed for failure to perform	1	No	1	No
1	Any contract ended early by mutual agreement following allegations	1	No	1	No
0	If answer to 2-5 is yes enclose details	0		0	
1	Assessed suitability & competence of staff who will be allocated this work	1	Fully Certified by Manufacturer + React Roadside Certified	1	Trained to Licence to fit standards including REACT

Tyre Pre-Qualification Questionnaire 2012

1	Name & Address of Firm	Watling Tyre Service Ltd 1/3 Pelham Road Gravesend Kent DA11 0HN	1	Direct Tyre Management Oasis Business Park, Parkside Place, Prescott Rd Skelmersdale Lancashire WN89RD	1	Tructyre Fleet Management LTD Goodwood House Eastleigh Hampshire SO50ANT
0	App number of staff who will be engaged in contract work		0		0	
0	Type of staff enclosed		0	25 Professional	0	4
6	Enclosed name & addresses of organisations your Firm provides similar work	6	6	6	6	6 companies named
1	Firms annual turnover 2011-2012	refer accounts	1	£14,855,000.00	1	£13,909,844
1	Firms annual turnover 2012-2013	refer accounts	1	£15,883,000.00	1	£14,665,791
1	Firms annual turnover 2013-2014	refer accounts	1	£15,596,201.00	1	£15,417,951
1	Firms annual turnover 2011-2012(Est)	refer accounts	1	£15,651,491.00	1	£26,693,429
1	In relation to worked performed in the past has a client refused to pay a bill	No	1	No	1	None
1	been the subject of judicial criticism or ordered to pay costs due to default	No	1	No	1	None
1	In the last 5 years any adverse complaints been made against your Firm	No	1	No	1	None
1	Are any staff within the firm subject to any qualification or limitations	No	1	No	1	None
1	Are any staff within the Firm likely to bring an action against the council	No	1	No	1	None
0	If yes please enclose details		0	No	0	n/a
1	Enclose details of how the Firm will ensure and maintain service	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Enclose statement of Firms details dealing with complaints	Yes	1	Yes	1	ISO9001:2008
1	Enclose details of how your Firm will deal with conflicts of interest	Yes	1	Yes	1	In House procedure
1	Enclose statement of how Firm would deliver this service	Yes	1	Yes	1	In House procedure
0			0		0	
0	SECTION D - EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES		0		0	
1	Do you have an equal opportunities or equality policy	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Is it your policy to comply with statutory obligations under current legislation	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Any unlawful discrimination or other in the last 3 years	No	1	No	1	No
1	In the last 3 years has your company been subject of a formal investigation	No	1	No	1	No
1	Does your policy set out instruction on recruitment, training, or promotion of staff	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Are documents available to employees, trade unions or other representative groups	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Are documents available in recruitment advertisement or other literature			No		Yes
1	Do you observe relevant equalities & non discrimination Code of Practice	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
0			0		0	
0	SECTION E - HEALTH & SAFETY		0		0	
1	Has your firm in the last 3 years been prosecuted for contravention of H&S Act	No	1	No	1	No
1	Name the person responsible for the implementation of your H & S policy	Andrew Wright	1	Sharon Chimside	1	John Brand
1	Enclose copy of your H & S policy, if you have 5 or more employees	Yes	1	Yes	1	Enclosed
1	How are your H & S policies and procedures conveyed to your staff	Policies to managers and cascaded down, also in vans	1	Induction and Intranet etc.	1	Tool Box Talks
1	State the Firms policy on training of employees in relation to H & S	Yes	1	Ongoing training by review of requirements	1	On induction and refresher every three years
0			0		0	
1	Does your Firms policy cover Emergency	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Procedures for reporting and recording accidents & dangerous occurrences	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	First Aid and Welfare provisions	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Provisions for appropriate protective clothing & equipment	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Enclosed Risk Assessment based upon the service that is to be provided.	Yes	1	Yes Cash only	1	Yes
0			0		0	
0	SECTION F - SUSTAINABILITY AND ENVIRONMENT		0		0	
1	Do you have a company environmental policy?	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	How does policy apply to tender?	Correct disposal of tyres/casings	1	See attached	1	Yes
1	Have you undertaken an environmental impact assessment?	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Do you address the environmental impact of whole life costs?	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Do you address the environmental impact of social/economic consequence of design?	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Do you address the environmental impact of use of non-renewable materials?	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Do you address the environmental impact of use of local resources?	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Do you address the environmental impact of logistics?	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Do you address the environmental impact of end of life recycling options?	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Do you address the environmental impact of disposal of products?	Yes	1	Yes	1	Yes
1	Who is responsible for environmental issues?	Roger Flury	1	Irene Stark	1	Steve Shingleton
2	Signed and dated	08/05/2015	2	08/05/2015	2	28/04/2015
95		97.9	93	92.6	88	93.7